

# SULZER ATTACKS MURPHY; 'M'CALL AS AGENT'

Ousted Governor, in Statement, Says the  
Tammany Leader Offered to Pay  
His Heavy Debts Out of  
Campaign Funds.

MAYORALTY CANDIDATE GO-BETWEEN

Chairman of the Public Service Commission Spoke of Tiger  
Boss as "The Chief," and Brought Many of His Mes-  
sages to "People's House," Is Assertion—  
"A Naked Fight of Dishonesty."

The following interview with Gov-  
ernor Sulzer is printed with the con-  
sent of "The Evening Mail":

By JAMES CREELMAN.

Copyright, 1913, by Mail and Express  
Company.

Albany, Oct. 20.—"I appeal from the  
Court of Impeachment and the merely  
nominal charges on which I was tried to  
the greater and higher Court of Public  
Opinion, before which I present the true  
and only reasons for my impeachment  
and removal," said Governor Sulzer.

It was a few minutes after I had heard  
the sonorous voice of Chief Judge Cullen  
pronouncing the thrilling judgment in the  
resplendent Court of Impeachment that  
cast the Governor of New York from the  
seat of office to which he was elected less  
than a year before.

Mr. Sulzer stood in the almost deserted  
Executive Mansion—tall, lean, with a  
calm look in his blue-gray eyes that con-  
trasted strongly with the excitement of the  
murmuring throng that swirled about the  
final scene of condemnation.

Mrs. Sulzer was in the room below, al-  
ready directing preparations for the with-  
drawal from the state's official residence.

"At last, thank God, my lips are un-  
censored," said Mr. Sulzer. "I can now tell  
the people of New York what the court  
that has convicted me would not have  
allowed me to tell under oath, and which  
I promised my lawyers not to speak of  
until the verdict was given."

It seemed hard to believe that this erect,  
smiling man, whose countenance once  
more shone with all the spirit of battle,  
was the condemned victim of a great  
conspiracy contrived by a political boss.

I had seen him during the most critical  
days of his struggle to maintain himself  
against the tremendous forces of ven-  
geance gathering for his destruction, pale,  
tired, drooping and discouraged.

But now his eyes were clear, his brow  
serene and his whole personality ani-  
mated with a new energy and earnest-  
ness.

The Real Ground of Quarrel.

"I was impeached," he said, "not be-  
cause of the offenses with which I was  
charged, but because I refused to do  
Charles F. Murphy's bidding, and, be-  
cause, as the records show, I have re-  
fused to surrender Mr. Murphy's corrupt  
henchmen in office."

Mr. Sulzer strode up and down the room,  
his hands locked behind his back,  
his head held high.

The real charge, the real offense, the  
real ground of quarrel between myself  
and the corrupt political machine that  
strive to destroy me should be known  
to the public.

"This has not been a fight about poli-  
tics, but a naked fight of dishonesty to  
crush a Governor of the State of New  
York because he dared to be his own  
master."

There was an unmistakable ring of sin-  
cerity in the voice of the man who, after  
twenty years of unstained public service,  
dared to attempt the overthrow of the  
Tammany boss and was himself over-  
thrown.

Murphy Offers Sulzer Money.

"Just prior to taking office as Governor  
—either just before Christmas or between  
Christmas and New Year—I spent an  
afternoon with Mr. Murphy at his request  
at his private room at Delmonico's," said  
the Governor. "His attitude was very  
friendly and confidential. He said he was  
my friend; that he knew of my financial  
condition and wished to help me out. As  
he went on I was amazed at his knowl-  
edge of my intimate personal affairs."

"To my astonishment he informed me  
that he knew that I was heavily in debt.  
Then he offered me money to pay my  
debts and have enough left to take things  
easy while Governor."

"Did he tell you where this money was  
to come from, Governor?"

"He said that this was really a party  
matter and that the money he would  
give me was party money. That I had  
been a popular candidate easily elected  
and for less money than any other can-  
didate in his recollection."

"He said that nobody would know any-  
thing about it; that I could pay what I  
owed and go to Albany feeling easy finan-  
cially. He then asked me how much I  
needed, to whom I owed it, and other  
personal questions."

Sulzer Refuses the Offer of Money.

"As I did not want to be tied hard and  
fast as Governor in advance, I declined  
Mr. Murphy's offer, saying that I was  
paying off my debts gradually; that my  
creditors were friends and would not  
press me; that I was economical; that I  
would try to get along on my salary as  
Governor."

"He repeated his offer of money, say-  
ing that it was for the good of the party;  
that the 'organization' did not want me  
to be hampered financially, and he (Mur-  
phy) would allow me whatever I needed  
above my salary for my living expenses  
while I was at the Executive Mansion."

"But again I refused, and then he said:  
"If you need money at any time let  
me know and you can have what you  
want. We cleaned up a lot of money on  
your campaign. I can afford to let you  
have what you want and never miss it."

How the Boss Seeks Weak Side of a  
Man.

Mr. Sulzer paused and thrust his hands  
in his pockets, jerking his head aside  
and pursing his lips.

"I am telling all this," he said, "because  
the people should know just how their  
elected officials are approached and  
tempted and how the boss seeks for the  
weak side of a man to control him."

Mr. Murphy did not attend my inau-  
guration. He came to Albany for the  
Presidential electors' meeting and I saw

him at the Executive Mansion. He wanted  
me to go to his hotel to confer with him.  
I wanted him to meet me in the Execu-  
tive Chamber or come to the Executive  
Mansion.

"He refused to do this and I declined to  
go to the hotel."

Met Murphy at McCall's House.

"Now, the next time I saw Mr. Murphy  
was at Judge Edward E. McCall's house  
in New York City on the night of the  
second of February. I talked from Albany  
with Mr. McCall over the telephone about  
the Public Service Commissionship."

"We made an appointment to meet at  
his house that night."

"I left Albany that afternoon for New  
York, and Judge McCall met me with his  
automobile at the 125th street station."

"He told me Mr. Murphy was at his  
house waiting for us."

"We talked going down to his house.  
He said he would accept the Public Ser-  
vice Commissionship if I would insist on  
it. But he wanted Mr. Murphy's consent,  
so there would be no difficulty about his  
confirmation."

"When we reached Judge McCall's  
house we went upstairs and I met Mr.  
Murphy in the front room. We talked  
over several matters. Judge McCall was  
present part of the time. Then we had  
dinner."

"After dinner Mr. Murphy and I dis-  
cussed matters at considerable length re-  
garding appointments. Mr. Murphy urged  
me to appoint his friend, John Galvin,  
Public Service Commissioner, in place of  
Mr. Wilcox, whose term had expired."

McCall and the Public Service Com-  
missionership.

"The subway question was very acute  
in New York and great pressure had been  
brought to bear on me by prominent citi-  
zens to reappoint Mr. Wilcox or to let  
him remain in office until the subway  
contracts were disposed of."

"I urged the appointment of Henry  
Morgenthau or George Foster Peabody  
or Colonel John Temple Graves. Mr.  
Murphy would not hear of these men. He  
talked long and earnestly in behalf of  
Mr. Galvin."

"Finally I suggested as a compromise  
Judge McCall. McCall himself said that  
he would accept, provided it was agree-  
able to Mr. Murphy."

"We discussed the subway question, the  
proposed contracts and various other mat-  
ters. The hour was getting late and I  
finally said that unless Judge McCall was  
agreeable to Mr. Murphy I would send in  
the name of Henry Morgenthau to the  
Senate the following Monday night, and  
if he was not confirmed, of course Mr.  
Wilcox would hold over, and that that  
would be agreeable to a great many promi-  
nent citizens in the city."

"Mr. Murphy was agreeable to the ap-  
pointment of Judge McCall, and it was  
understood that the Judge should send me  
his resignation by messenger Monday  
afternoon."

Appointments That Murphy Demanded

"At this meeting and subsequently Mr.  
Murphy demanded from me pledges re-  
garding legislation, and especially con-  
cerning appointments to the Public Ser-  
vice commissions, the Health Department,  
the Labor Department, the State Hospital  
Commission, the Department of State  
Prisons and the Department of High-  
ways. He insisted that George M. Palmer  
should be appointed chairman and Pat-  
rick E. McCabe a member of the Public  
Service Commission of the 3d District.  
This is the 'Packy' McCabe who is Mur-  
phy's political lieutenant in Albany."

"Mr. Murphy further insisted upon hav-  
ing 'The McManus for Labor Commis-  
sioner, a man named Meyers for State  
Architect, a man from Brooklyn whose  
name I forget for State Hospital Com-  
missioner, and James E. Gaffney for  
Highway Commissioner. In case I wished  
to supplant Mr. Reel, Mr. Murphy said  
that Reel ought to be kept, as he was a  
good man. This is the same Reel whom  
I subsequently removed."

"Gaffney or War," Murphy's Message.

"Mr. Murphy added that if I wished a  
new Commissioner of Highways 'Jim'  
Gaffney was the best all-around man for  
the job. Subsequently he demanded the  
appointment of Gaffney, and still later a  
prominent New Yorker came to me in the  
Executive Mansion bringing the message  
from Mr. Murphy that it was 'Gaffney or  
war.' I declined to appoint Gaffney."

"This is the Gaffney who, only a few  
months afterward, on September 4, 1913,  
in undisputed testimony before the Su-  
preme Court at New York, was shown to  
have demanded and received \$30,000 in money  
(refusing to take a check) from one of  
the aqueduct contractors, nominally for  
'adv.' This is the man who Mr. Mur-  
phy demanded should be put in a po-  
sition where he would superintend and  
control the spending of sixty-five millions  
of the money of the state in road con-  
tracts."

The lines around Mr. Sulzer's mouth  
tightened as he recalled the scene at the  
McCall house, and his fingers twitched.

"How could I, how could any honest  
Governor consider such a man for such a  
place?" he exclaimed. "How could I face  
the people after such a surrender?"

"Shortly before midnight we left Judge  
McCall's house in his automobile and he  
and Mr. Murphy accompanied me to the  
Grand Central Depot, where I took the  
train for Albany."

Murphy Determined on Gaffney.

"When I removed Reel from the office  
of Commissioner of Highways I began to  
hear pretty vigorously from Mr. Murphy,  
who was more determined than ever to  
secure the place for 'Jim' Gaffney."

"Was this over the long distance tele-  
phone, Mr. Sulzer?"

"No, sir. When I saw Mr. Murphy at  
Delmonico's before I came to Albany I  
told him plainly I would not talk over the

telephone to him while I was Governor."

"Did you say it in that blunt way, or  
did you merely express an opinion that it  
would not be good policy?"

"Well, I had heard a good deal about  
the telephone talks between Albany and  
'headquarters' in New York, either at 14th  
street or Delmonico's or Good Ground.  
When Mr. Murphy at this time suggested  
that he keep in touch with me over the  
telephone, I told him at once that I did  
not want to talk with him over the tele-  
phone."

"Then he said: 'Well, if I have anything  
to say to you I will send you word  
through some friend, or by Mr. Delaney,  
or some one in the Legislature.' I said:  
'That will do.'"

Conference in Washington.

"About the fifth of March, just after  
President Wilson's inauguration, I visited  
the President in the White House. When  
I came out I met Thomas F. Smith, sec-  
retary of Tammany Hall, in front of the  
White House. He wanted to know what I  
had said to the President and what the  
President had said to me. I told him I  
made it a rule never to discuss conversa-  
tions that I had with the President."

"Mr. Smith said Mr. Murphy wanted me  
in his opinion, was the best man for the  
place; that he would see to it that Gaf-  
fney was promptly confirmed; that Gaf-  
fney would make good, and that I would  
never have cause to regret it. He asked  
me again to give him a promise to appoint  
Gaffney. I told him I would not make a  
promise about it; that I would consider  
all he said, but that in my opinion Mr.  
Gaffney would not do; that it would be  
a mistake to appoint him; that the people  
would not stand for it; that Mr. Gaffney  
was too close to him."

"Mr. Murphy finally said: 'I am for  
Gaffney. The organization demands his  
appointment and I want you to do it.'"

"I replied: 'I will make no promise  
about it.'"

"He said: 'It will be Gaffney or war.'"

Declared He Would Block Everything.

As Mr. Sulzer continued to pace the  
room and tell how one man without office  
or title or official responsibility of any  
kind attempted to reduce the elected  
Governor of New York to his will the old  
deep lines came back into his face and  
his eyes grew hard.

"I had several talks with Mr. Murphy  
and in some of these talks I told him I



CHARLES F. MURPHY.

to meet him and some of the Democratic  
state leaders at Senator O'Gorman's  
rooms in the Shoreham Hotel at 8 o'clock  
that night. He asked me if I would be  
there, and I said, 'Yes.'"

"I went to the Shoreham that night.  
There were present Senator O'Gorman,  
Mr. Murphy, Norman E. Mack and Mr.  
Fitzpatrick, the Murphy leader in Buffalo;  
Mr. McGoey, the Murphy leader of  
Brooklyn; Thomas F. Smith and myself.  
State affairs were discussed in a general  
way. I took very little part in the talk."

Murphy Follows Him into the Hall.

"I had made arrangements to leave for  
New York with my staff and Mrs. Sulzer,  
and about 11 o'clock I shook hands with  
all and bade them good night."

"As I went out Mr. Murphy followed me  
into the hall. He told me he was very  
anxious to get away to Hot Springs, but  
didn't want to go until Albany matters  
were straightened out."

"He asked me if I would give him my  
assurance that I would appoint his friend  
'Jim' Gaffney Commissioner of Highways.  
That place, you will remember, controlled  
the immediate spending of \$65,000,000 for  
good roads, the very same work in which  
Mr. Hennessy's investigations have re-  
cently uncovered frauds amounting to  
millions of dollars in twenty-two counties  
under the Reel administration."

Free Hand if He Named Gaffney.

"Mr. Murphy seemed very much  
aroused. He said he would like to have  
the matter settled before he went away;  
that if I would appoint Mr. Gaffney I  
could have my own way regarding other  
matters."

"Do you mean to say that a man like  
Murphy had the audacity to speak to the  
Governor of New York like that?"

"Oh, yes. You don't know Murphy, or  
you wouldn't ask that question."

"Mr. Murphy assured me that he was  
more interested in Gaffney's appointment  
than in anything else in the state; that  
Gaffney was a good all-around man for  
the job, knew what to do and could get  
results."

"I told him that in my opinion it would  
be a mistake to appoint Mr. Gaffney. I  
repeated to him practically what I had  
said at Judge McCall's house, and also  
at his own house, a few days before."

Murphy Threatens "Gaffney or War."

"Mr. Murphy said to me, 'I want you  
to appoint Gaffney. It is an organization  
matter. I will appreciate it.'"

"I said: 'I will consider all you say  
about the matter. I want to go slow and  
get the very best man I can find for that  
position. I would rather be slow about  
the appointment than be sorry.'"

"And he answered: 'If you don't ap-  
point Gaffney you WILL be sorry.'"

"I told him that I thought the appoint-  
ment for Highway Commissioner should be  
to an upstate man; that the people up  
the state expected the Governor to appoint  
an upstate man; that there was a prevail-  
ing sentiment to that effect."

"He replied that there was nothing in  
that; that New York City paid most of  
the money, and was just as much enti-  
tled to the place as the upstate people."

"Again Mr. Murphy said that Gaffney,

in his opinion, was the best man for the  
place; that he would see to it that Gaf-  
fney was promptly confirmed; that Gaf-  
fney would make good, and that I would  
never have cause to regret it. He asked  
me again to give him a promise to appoint  
Gaffney. I told him I would not make a  
promise about it; that I would consider  
all he said, but that in my opinion Mr.  
Gaffney would not do; that it would be  
a mistake to appoint him; that the people  
would not stand for it; that Mr. Gaffney  
was too close to him."

"Mr. Murphy finally said: 'I am for  
Gaffney. The organization demands his  
appointment and I want you to do it.'"

"I replied: 'I will make no promise  
about it.'"

"He said: 'It will be Gaffney or war.'"

Declared He Would Block Everything.

As Mr. Sulzer continued to pace the  
room and tell how one man without office  
or title or official responsibility of any  
kind attempted to reduce the elected  
Governor of New York to his will the old  
deep lines came back into his face and  
his eyes grew hard.

"I had several talks with Mr. Murphy  
and in some of these talks I told him I

that Mr. Murphy wanted me to appoint  
him."

Murphy's Objections to John Mitchell.

"But about John Mitchell, Governor Sul-  
zer? What was Mr. Murphy's objection  
to him?"

"I urged the peculiar qualifications of  
Mitchell, and he said Mitchell was not a  
Democrat, and that he was a Roosevelt  
man, adding: 'He is a Progressive and  
you are heading the same way.'"

"I replied that Mitchell was a good  
enough Democrat to get every Demo-  
cratic vote in the Legislature of Illinois  
for United States Senator and to be ef-  
fered the Democratic nomination for Vice-  
President at the Denver convention."

"However," I said, "it is immaterial to me  
whether he is a Democrat or not. He is  
the most experienced and competent man  
in the state, in my opinion, for the place."

Refused to Put Murphy's Men on the  
Bench.

"We talked over the appointments to  
vacancies on the Supreme Court bench for  
the 1st Department. Mr. Murphy was  
very anxious that I should appoint  
Michael J. McGuire and Mr. Gillespie  
to two of these vacancies, and urged the  
matter on me very strongly. In talking  
about these appointments to the Supreme  
Court bench I told him under no circum-  
stances would I appoint any lawyer to  
the Supreme Court unless I met with the  
approval of the Bar Association."

"As a matter of fact, I refused to name  
Mr. Murphy's candidates for the Supreme  
Court vacancies, but appointed Bartow  
S. Weeks and Eugene S. Philbin."

Threat to Wreck His Administration.

"It was in this very conversation that  
Mr. Murphy said to me: 'Unless you do  
what I want you to do I will wreck your  
administration as Governor, block all your  
legislation, and defeat all your appoint-  
ments.'"

"He said: 'Remember, I control the  
Legislature, and the Legislature can con-  
trol the Governor.'"

"He also threatened me with public  
disgrace unless I agreed to his programme  
on legislative matters and appointments."

"It was at this conference, too, that  
he talked about the things 'he had  
on me,' and said that I had better listen  
to him and not to his enemies up the  
state; that if I did what he told me to I  
would have things easy, and no trouble,  
and that if I didn't do what he wanted  
me to I would have all the trouble I  
wanted."

Mr. Sulzer's eyes fairly blazed as he  
spoke of the insulting threats of the  
Tammany boss. He clenched his fists and  
crunched his jaws until the muscles stood  
out sharply.

Would Make Him a Laughing Stock.

"Think of a Governor of the great State  
of New York having to listen to such  
language from such a man! I told him  
that I was the Governor and that if he  
would let me alone I could succeed, but  
that I could not succeed if I was to be  
a cat's paw for him. I told him that  
I wanted to give the state an honest and  
efficient administration; that in my op-  
inion that would do more to help the party  
than anything else."

"What did Mr. Murphy say to that,  
Governor?"

"He was very insulting. Then I asked  
him what he could do to destroy me.  
And he said: 'Never mind, you will find  
out in good time. Stand by the organi-  
zation and you will be all right. If you  
go against the organization I will make  
your administration the laughing stock  
of the state.'"

"I told him that all I wanted was to  
do right, be honest and carry out my  
oath of office. He laughed at this, and  
said that some of the men I had around  
me would run away from me just as soon  
as trouble began."

Tried to Stop Investigation of Prisons.

"It was at this time that he asked me  
to call off George Blake, the commissioner  
who was investigating the prisons. He  
said that Blake must be called off and  
that he didn't want the prisons investi-  
gated unless we could agree upon some  
man to do it. I told him that Blake was  
an efficient man and that I was going to  
let him go on with his work, and he said:  
'If you do you will be sorry for it. Mark  
what I am telling you now!'"

"I told him what I had heard about the  
vileness of things in the Sing Sing and  
Auburn prisons. I said: 'We certainly  
ought not to stand for them. I want to  
get at the facts, and if there is anything  
wrong, stop it; if there is any graft,  
eliminate it.'"

"Mr. Murphy told me that he didn't want  
anything done in connection with Sing  
Sing prison by Blake or any other man;  
that the warden there, Mr. Kennedy, was  
a friend of his and a good man and he  
wanted him left alone. This, remember,  
was the warden whom I afterward re-  
moved from his place on charges and  
who was since indicted by the West-  
chester grand jury."

As Mr. Sulzer told his story of the  
boss's attempt to seize the state govern-  
ment he gave names and dates and  
places in a convincing, straightforward  
narrative. There was no hesitation,  
no evasion. He gave the facts like one who  
had been through an ordeal so terrible  
that every event had been burned into  
his memory."

McCall Murphy's Emissary.

"When Mr. Murphy found out that he  
could not use me and control me he sent  
emissaries to see me frequently to de-  
mand that I do certain things and to  
threaten me if I refused. You must not  
forget that I was then Governor of the  
Empire State. These threats began in a  
small way in February and continued  
with greater vehemence up to the very  
night the Assembly passed the resolution  
of impeachment in obedience to Mr. Mur-  
phy's orders."

"One of the agents through whom Mr.  
Murphy most frequently communicated  
with me was Judge McCall. Judge McCall  
usually spoke of Mr. Murphy as 'the  
Chief,' and would say to me that 'the  
Chief' wished such and such a thing done  
or demanded that I follow such and such  
a course of action."

"Every Tammany member of the Legis-  
lature of either house who approached me  
from day to day used the same language,  
saying that 'the Chief' demanded this or  
demanded that, or that 'the Chief' had  
telephoned to put through such a piece of  
legislation, or kill some other piece of  
legislation."

Refused to Serve "The Chief."

"I was impeached, not because of any  
misdoings, but because I declined to re-  
cognize Mr. Murphy as 'the Chief'—the  
invaluable and all-powerful 'Chief' of  
the government of this state; because I  
would not obey 'the Chief's' telephone or

cause he had refused to obey the inva-  
lible government."

Whatever his faults may be, and what-  
ever may be the truth about his attitude  
toward campaign funds when he was  
running for office, there can be no doubt  
that he was honestly elected and no one  
can examine his official record since he  
took his oath of office, as I have, without  
realizing how hard he tried to be a faith-  
ful Governor."

"At this conference," said Mr. Sulzer,  
"I urged Mr. Murphy to let me carry out  
in good faith the platform pledges of the  
Democratic party for direct nominations.  
We talked over the bill. I told him there  
was a strong sentiment throughout the  
state in favor of this legislation. He said  
I was mistaken, that there was no senti-  
ment for direct primaries except from a  
few cranks."

"I called his attention to the pledge in  
the platform. He said he was opposed  
to any bill that abolished the state con-  
vention and eliminated the party emblem."

"I said that there could be no honest  
direct primary law unless that were  
done. He answered that the organization  
would never agree to any bill that did it,  
and that such a bill would be overwhelm-  
ingly defeated in the Legislature. I said  
to him that UNLESS WE MADE GOOD  
ON DIRECT PRIMARIES WE WOULD  
LOSE THE STATE. He replied that I  
did not know what I was talking about."

"We again talked over appointments to  
vacancies on the Supreme Court bench,  
and I said that I was being criticized by  
the judges and others for not filling the  
vacancies. He talked over several names  
that would be agreeable to him, Mc-  
Guire, Gillespie and others. I told him  
that I thought I ought to select the very  
best lawyers I could get, and said again  
that I would make no appointments un-  
less the names were approved by the Bar  
Association. That was the last time I  
saw Mr. Murphy, and I returned to the  
hotel very much disheartened."

Threatened to Disgrace and Destroy  
Sulzer.

"Before we parted that night I warned  
Mr. Murphy that he would wreck the  
party and accomplish his own destruction  
if he persisted in shielding grafters and  
violating platform pledges. His angry  
retort was that I was an ingrate, and  
that he would disgrace and destroy me."

"Every man who has borne the weight  
of a great office like that of the Governor  
of New York will appreciate my position.  
I wished to keep in with the organization.  
I was anxious to avoid a break with it.  
I knew only too well the Legislature  
would obey Mr. Murphy's every order,  
whether given over the telephone or in  
person. I knew the terrible odds against  
me in the fight which I counted when I  
declined to submit to Mr. Murphy's dic-  
tation; when I declined to turn my office  
into an instrument for the corruption of  
government and the debauching of the  
state. I was reluctant to break with  
Mr. Murphy. I did it only because it be-  
came impossible to do otherwise and not  
betray my oath of office and forfeit every  
shred of self-respect."

It is impossible to put in words the  
earnestness and simple sincerity of Mr.  
Sulzer's manner as he said this."

"When I returned to Albany after my  
last interview with Mr. Murphy I care-  
fully considered my plight and the whole  
state situation. It was only at that time,  
not since, that I was only at that time,  
not